# #13

#### **INCOMPLETE**

**Collector:** Email Invitation 1 (Email)

Started: Monday, January 04, 2021 5:10:27 PM Last Modified: Friday, January 15, 2021 3:56:37 PM

Time Spent: Over a week

First Name: Mary
Last Name: Graham

Email: Mary.Graham@gcccd.edu

Custom Data: Tutoring IP Address: 68.7.146.103

# Page 1: I. Program Overview and Update

## Q1

I.1 Department(s) Reviewed:

Learning Assistant/Tutoring

## Q2

1.2 Lead Author

Mary Graham

# Q3

I.3 Collaborator(s) - List any person that participated in the preparation of this report

Taylor Fiehler-Roose, Dante Jones, Samantha Lee, Veronica Nieves-Cortez, various tutors and students

# Q4

I.4 Dean/Manager:

Kerry Kilber Rebman

I.5 Program Update: Please summarize the changes, additions, and achievements that have occurred in your program since the last program review was submitted. To access your 2020 program review, visit the Program Review webpage.

Move to Remote Service with Video, Phone, and Email Tutoring Services: Due to the pandemic, in Spring 2020, we moved from predominantly in-person delivery, with some asynchronous email tutoring, to entirely remote delivery within one week. To ensure all of our students could be served and because these students had varying levels of access to technology and internet service, we created options for video, phone, and email sessions.

Trained Tutors in Remote Delivery Technology: Tutors were trained in whichever forms of remote delivery their individual technological access would support. This training has been updated each semester since the initial move to a remote environment.

Consolidation into One Virtual Center: In order to simplify access for students in the new remote environment and to provide the most comprehensive hours possible, we consolidated the three physical tutoring centers (ARC, STEM, Writing Center) into one virtual center in Zoom, where students could get access to all subjects for Fall 2020.

Getting the Word Out: We created handouts in English, Spanish, and Arabic guiding students through the process of making video, phone, or email appointments. We posted these to the revised website, to the Student Help container in Canvas, and we shared them with faculty and asked them to distribute to students.

New Direct Link to Campus Tutoring from all Canvas Course Containers: For Spring 2021, there is a direct link to campus tutoring services from all Canvas containers. Previously, the only direct link went to NETTUTOR, a contract tutoring service. That link has now been replaced, and the new link goes to a form students can use to directly request a tutoring appointment with campus tutors without having to click on other links on the tutoring webpage, or email for an appointment, or call. (Students will still be able to email and call for appointments if they cannot navigate the form or do not wish to).

Begun process of reviewing standards, collecting data, and continuing training so that the program can apply to the Association of College Tutoring and Learning Association (ACTLA) for certification of our online tutoring program.

Initiated collaboration with the Cuyamaca Scholars Program to host and support a Cuyamaca Scholars mentor.

#### Page 2: II. Assessment and Student Achievement

### Q6

II.A.1 Is your program following the assessment plan on file with the SLO Coordinator (or Outcome Assessment Committee)?

Yes, the assessment plan is on file and the program is following the plan

## Q7

OPTIONAL: You may upload a copy of your SLO assessment plan for SLOAC here. If you have an Excel sheet, please convert to one of the supported files listed below before submission.

Respondent skipped this question

Page 3: II. Assessment and Student Achievement

Respondent skipped this question

You indicated either 1) the department assessment plan is on file, but work is needed to update the plan, or 2) the department has no assessment plan on file and/or the program is not currently following assessment planII.A.1a Please describe how your program is adjusting (or developing) its assessment plan to ensure all courses are assessed within the assessment 4-cycle:

Page 4: II. Assessment and Student Achievement

II.A.2 Please provide an analysis of your Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs) findings over the past year and what changes, if any, were made as a result. This may include, for example, changes to departmental practices, program improvements, and/or professional development opportunities over the past year. \*If the department did not complete assessments during the COVID-19 public health crisis, please note that here and provide additional context.

(NOTE: Tutoring has Program Level Outcomes which encompass student outcomes as well as other outcomes).

PLO 1: Promote tutee empowerment, independence, and long-term success through culturally conscious, learner-centered, process-oriented tutoring which promotes self-regulated learning. This PLO was not scheduled to be assessed again until 2022; however, with the move to remote tutoring, and with the steep drop-off in tutoring usage, we wanted to check in with tutees about their experiences in Fall 2020. In a survey provided to the 157 students who had attended two or more Zoom tutoring sessions in a wide variety of disciplines by Week 12 of Fall 2020, 21% (33 students) responded. In an item stating "I felt more confident in my class work after my Zoom tutoring session," 33.3% of students (11) checked "Strongly Agree," 60.6% of students (20) checked "Agree," 3% (1 student) checked "Disagree," and 3% (1 student) checked "Strongly Disagree." These unsatisfied students may have received poor tutoring or may simply have had unrealistic expectations about what tutoring can and does do. Regardless, we conducted a tutor survey to identify challenges and successful strategies, held end-of-term meetings in Fall 2020 with tutors to further elaborate on their needs and challenges, and will conduct a pre-semester "Best Practices in Remote Tutoring" training on January 25, 2021 based on that feedback.

We also provided surveys to 45 students who had two or more email writing tutoring sessions (submitting an essay for asynchronous assistance). We continue to be especially concerned about this type of tutoring since it does not allow the tutor to engage the tutee in reflection, application of skills, scaffolding of growth or understanding, not does it necessarily allow the tutor to help the tutee plan next steps of action -- all critical metacognitive steps in helping students develop as learners. (It might be worth noting that The Association of College Tutoring and Learning Assistance, or ACTLA, does not even consider this form of support "tutoring" because of all the critical elements of reflection and demonstrated learning that cannot be completed in this format). Only 11% (5) tutees responded. In response to an item stating "After making corrections based on the tutor's comments, I felt more confident about my ability to edit my essay," 80% (4) "Strongly Agreed," and 20% (1) "Strongly Disagreed." Again, we conducted a tutor survey to identify challenges and successful strategies, held end-of-term meetings with tutors in Fall 2020 to further elaborate on their needs and challenges, and will conduct a pre-semester "Best Practices in Remote Tutoring" training on January 25, 2021 based on that feedback.

PLO 2: Positively impact student success, retention, persistence, improvement, and completion – with special focus on issues of disproportionate impact. This PLO was to be assessed in Spring 2020; however, it takes several semesters' worth of data to make the assessment meaningful, and the assessment must be conducted by the IESE office. In communicating with the very busy IESE, we all agreed to delay the assessment of this PLO so that it will include Spring 2021. (It should also be noted that STEM Data collection has only been truly reliable since Spring 2019, so it is better to allow a few semesters of data to accumulate).

PLO 3: Support instructors and programs by providing individualized academic support that meets the specific needs of our diverse body of students. Due to be assessed in Spring 2020 -- delayed due to pandemic.

PLO 4: Promote pursuit of education and educational career goals among our diverse pool of Cuyamaca Student and Cuyamaca Alumni tutors. Due to be assessed in Spring 2020 -- delayed due to pandemic.

### Page 5: II. Assessment and Student Achievement

II.B.1. What progress has been made in your program to address the institutional goals set around student success and equity? (2019 Equity Plan) If qualitative or quantitative data is available, please summarize any findings.

Given that Learning Assistance/Tutoring can only positively impact student success for those students that we actually see -- and given that the IESE office must spend precious time performing all Learning Assistance data requests -- in collaboration with IESE, Learning Assistance is focusing on a disaggregated analysis of student usage of our services for this annual update.

Tutoring examined two sets of students: those who attended tutoring once and those who attended tutoring two or more times.

The set of students who used tutoring only once was disaggregated and compared to all students who attended Cuyamaca in 2019-2020. (If male students represented 43% of the total college student population in 2019-2020, what percentage of all the students who attended Tutoring 1 time were male?)

Likewise, the set of students who used tutoring two or more times was disaggregated and compared to all students who attended Cuyamaca in 2019-2020. (If male students represented 43% of the total student population in 2019-2020, what percentage of all the students who attended Tutoring two or more times were male?)

By looking at the results for both sets of students, we hoped to identify which demographic groups, if any, were not using our services at all and which groups were coming once but not coming back.

Approximately 15% (1,858) of the college's 12,783 students in 2019-2020 attended at least one tutoring session across the three Tutoring Centers (ARC, STEM, and Writing Center). Approximately 6% of Cuyamaca students attended only one session, and approximately 9% attended more than one session.

Disaggregated Analysis of Students Who Attended Only One Tutoring Session:

Tutoring was highly successful in making a single contact with three traditionally under-served groups -- students with disabilities, economically disadvantaged students, and first-generation college students. All three of these groups were well-represented among those students who attended one tutoring session (12% of the students who attended one tutoring session had one or more disabilities, though students with disabilities represented only 8% of the college population that academic year; 68% of of the students who attended one tutoring session were economically disadvantaged, though students in this category only represented 45% of the overall student population, and 39% of students who attended one tutoring session were First Generation College Students, as compared to the 36% of the overall student population they represented.)

Unfortunately, among all students who attended one tutoring session, we saw an under-representation of Black, Native American, and Latino students, students age 20-24 years old, and veteran students.

Disaggregated Analysis of Students Who Attended Two or More Tutoring Sessions:

Tutoring was, again highly successful at connecting with three traditionally under-served groups. Students with disabilities, economically disadvantaged students, and first-generation college students were well represented in the group that attended two or more tutoring session. 16% of students who attended Tutoring two or more times had one or more disabilities, though they represent only 8% of the college population. (So, the percentage of students with disabilities who came to tutoring two or more times was twice the percentage of the overall student population this group represented). 67% of of the students that tutoring saw two or more times were economically disadvantaged students, though students in this category only represent 45% of the student population and 41% of the students who were seen two or more times by tutoring were first-generation college students, as compared to the 36% of the student population they represented.

Unfortunately among students who attended two or more sessions, there was an under-representation of male students; Black, Native American, Asian, and Latino students; students under 25 years old; veteran students; and foster youth.

II.B.2 In light of the goals set in your program review, what are your plans to improve equitable student outcomes (success, retention, persistence, graduation, etc.) in the coming year?

Streamline access to tutoring by placing a direct link from Canvas to a request form for campus tutoring to make it easier for students to seek help.

Reach out to the veteran's counselor and EOPS regarding service to Veterans and Foster Youth.

It is our habit to provide some sort of orientation for Pathway Academy students, in Spring 2021, we will provide an orientation for Pathway Academy mentors and seek their feedback on how we might better serve their students.

We will approach the Umoja program about an orientation or about ways to connect with their students.

We hope to conduct some focus groups around perceptions and attitudes towards tutoring among both students and faculty -- who are the primary referral source of students. (Whether this activity happens this year or next will depend partly on the busy schedule of the IESE).

We will complete certification of our online tutoring program to ensure we are meeting professional standard for this type of service. It is important to offer high quality service to the campus.

We will continue our efforts to support growth in cultural competence and anti-racism for our tutors by encouraging them to view resources in the Vision Resource Center, events supported by the college and SSEC, and by encouraging them to follow the Learning Assistance Facebook page or Instagram, where we regularly post items related to diversity, equity, and inclusion. (Indeed, tutors are encouraged to contribute content for that social media).

#### Page 6: II. Assessment and Student Achievement

Q12 No

Do you offer distance education (online) courses? (excluding emergency remote teaching in 2020)?

Page 7: II. Assessment and Student Achievement

Q13 Respondent skipped this question

II.C.1 If there were differences in success rates for distance education (online) versus in-person sections of program courses in your last comprehensive program review, what has the department done to address these disparities? If online and in-person sections had comparable success rates, please describe what the program did to achieve that.

Respondent skipped this question

II.C.2 What mechanisms are in place to ensure regular and effective contact? For resources, see Cuyamaca Guide to Best Practices in Online Teaching

Page 8: III. Previous Goals: Update

## Q15

Goal 1:

Support AB 705 implementation and campus acceleration efforts by providing embedded tutoring and increased tutoring support for English, ESL, and Mathematics.

# Q16

In Progress - will carry this goal forward into next year

**Goal Status** 

Page 9: III. Previous Goals: Update continued

Q17

Respondent skipped this question

Please describe the results or explain the reason for deletion/completion of the goal:

Q18

Respondent skipped this question

Do you have another goal to update?

Page 10: III. Previous Goals: Update continued

Action steps for the next year: If you are requesting resources in order to achieve this goal, please list them below as action steps and specify the type of request (e.g. submit technology request for new laptop computers).

Due to funding issues and the increase in California minimum wage, which increases all levels of tutoring compensation annually, tutoring has not been able to embed in more than one or two sections of English and/or ESL since Spring 2018. (In three of the intervening semesters, the program could not afford to embed any tutors in one or both disciplines).

Spring 2021: Embed in 3-4 synchronous ESL classes

Spring 2021: Embed in 3-4 online English classes and collect best practices information for supporting online English courses.

Spring 2021: Pilot embedded tutoring in math.

Seek additional funding to continue (and perhaps expand) embedded tutoring in 2021-2022.

Monitor usage of embedded tutor by students in sections with an embedded tutor, and communicate this information with instructors and tutors to encourage maximum usage of the embedded tutor and tutoring in general.

Hold a meeting with embedded tutors from all disciplines so that they can share information and strategies.

Collect qualitative data from instructors, students, and tutors to improve program.

Seek to certify the campus online tutoring program.

Work with IESE to assess quantitative impact of this program and to disaggregate both usage and impact data.

Q20 Yes

Do you have another goal to update?

Page 11: III. Previous Goals: Update continued

#### **Q21**

#### Goal 2:

Address equity gaps by promoting course retention and success, as well as overall student completion, by embedding in courses that are commonly taken by first-year students and which traditionally have high failure/drop/withdrawal rates.

# Q22 In Progress - will carry this goal forward into next year

**Goal Status** 

Page 12: III. Previous Goals: Update continued

Please describe the results or explain the reason for deletion/completion of the goal:

Respondent skipped this question

Respondent skipped this question

Respondent skipped this question

Page 13: III. Previous Goals: Update continued

## **Q25**

Action steps for the next year: If you are requesting resources in order to achieve this goal, please list them below as action steps and specify the type of request (e.g. submit technology request for new laptop computers).

Coordinate with chairs/coordinators and instructors of classes that are both commonly taken by first year students and which traditionally have high D/F/W rates to embed tutors.

Monitor usage of embedded tutor by students in sections with an embedded tutor, and communicate this information with instructors and tutors to encourage maximum usage of the embedded tutor and tutoring in general.

Hold a meeting with embedded tutors from all disciplines so that they can share information and strategies.

Collect qualitative data from instructors, students, and tutors to improve program.

Seek to certify the campus online tutoring program.

Work with IESE to assess quantitative impact of this program and to disaggregate both usage and impact data.

Q26  Do you have another goal to update?	No
Page 14: III. Previous Goals: Update continued	
Q27	Respondent skipped this question
Goal 3:	
Q28 Goal Status	Respondent skipped this question

Page 15: III. Previous Goals: Update continued

Q29	Respondent skipped this question
Please describe the results or explain the reason for deletion/completion of the goal:	
Q30	Respondent skipped this question
Do you have another goal to update?	
Page 16: III. Previous Goals: Update continued	
Q31	Respondent skipped this question
Action steps for the next year: If you are requesting resources in order to achieve this goal, please list them below as action steps and specify the type of request (e.g. submit technology request for new laptop computers).	
Q32	Respondent skipped this question
Do you have another goal to update?	
Page 17: III. Previous Goals: Update continued	
Q33	Respondent skipped this question
Goal 4:	
Q34	Respondent skipped this question
Goal Status	
Page 18: III. Previous Goals: Update continued	
Q35	Respondent skipped this question
Please describe the results or explain the reason for deletion/completion of the goal:	
Page 19: III. Previous Goals: Update continued	
Q36	Respondent skipped this question
Action steps for the next year: If you are requesting resources in order to achieve this goal, please list them below as action steps and specify the type of request (e.g. submit technology request for new laptop computers).	

Page 20: IV. New Goals

Q37 Yes

Would you like to propose any new goal(s)?

Page 21: IV. New Goals continued

### **Q38**

New Goal 1:

Work collaboratively with Learning Assistance staff, Faculty Tutoring Coordinator, Learning Assistance Center Advisory Committee, Student Success and Equity Council, Academic Senate, other constituents, and campus administration to review and refine the staffing and organization plan for the Learning Assistance Department in order to meet the current and future needs of the college and its students. This plan will also seek to establish a baseline budget for the program. It will also take into account recommendations regarding Learning Assistance from the statewide Academic Senate as well as professional standards identified by national tutoring organizations, such as the Association of Collège Tutoring and Learning Assistance.

Q39 Guided Student Pathways

Which College Strategic Goal does this department goal most directly support? (Check only one)

### Q40

Please describe how this goal advances the college strategic goal identified above.

In order to help students "Get on the Path" and "Stay on the Path," the college needs to ensure that the infrastructure behind learning assistance is following best practices and operating as efficiently and effectively as possible.

#### **Q41**

Please indicate how this goal was informed by SLO (student learning outcome) assessment results, PLO (program learning outcome) assessment results, student achievement data, or other qualitative or quantitative data (from any source):

The Cuyamaca Academic Senate and campus administrative have requested a review of the current structure of Learning Assistance and the pilot of having a faculty coordinator over the Learning Assistance Program in order for the Learning Assistance Center Advisory Committee to evaluate and support or modify the existing structure and provide a recommendation. That recommendation would then be vetted and potentially adapted through campus participatory governance processes.

Action steps for this year:If you are requesting resources in order to achieve this goal, please list them below as action steps and specify the type of request (e.g. submit technology request for new computer hardware).

Gather information on the structure and funding of other Tutoring Programs to share with the Learning Assistance Center Advisory Committee, Student Success and Equity Council, and Academic Senate. Then, work with LACAC to create a staffing plan and baseline budget recommendation to vet through the campus participatory governance structure.

That ultimate recommendation will then be presented to the college administration.

## Q43

How will this goal be evaluated?

If the Learning Assistance Center Advisory Committee is able to make a recommendation to Student Success and Equity Council and then Academic Senate, and if that recommendation is supported -- or modified -- the campus will have a plan for the future of Learning Assistance.

Q44	No
Do you have another new goal?	
Page 22: IV. New Goals continued	
Q45	Respondent skipped this question
New Goal 2:	
Q46	Respondent skipped this question
Which College Strategic Goal does this department goal most directly support?	
Q47	Respondent skipped this question
Please describe how this goal advances the college strategic goal identified above.	
Q48	Respondent skipped this question
Please indicate how this goal was informed by SLO (student learning outcome) assessment results, PLO (program learning outcome) assessment results, student achievement data, or other qualitative or quantitative data (from any source):	

Q49 Respondent skipped this question Action steps for this year:If you are requesting resources in order to achieve this goal, please list them below as action steps and specify the type of request (e.g. submit technology request for new computer hardware). **Q50** Respondent skipped this question How will this goal be evaluated? **Q51** Respondent skipped this question Do you have another new goal? Page 23: IV. New Goals continued Q52 Respondent skipped this question New Goal 3: Q53 Respondent skipped this question Which College Strategic Goal does this department goal most directly support? **Q54** Respondent skipped this question Please describe how this goal advances the college strategic goal identified above. **Q55** Respondent skipped this question Please indicate how this goal was informed by SLO (student learning outcome) assessment results, PLO (program learning outcome) assessment results, student achievement data, or other qualitative or quantitative data (from any source): **Q56** Respondent skipped this question Action steps for this year:If you are requesting resources in order to achieve this goal, please list them below as action steps and specify the type of request (e.g. submit technology request for new computer hardware). **Q57** Respondent skipped this question

How will this goal be evaluated?

Q58  Do you have another new goal?	Respondent skipped this question
Page 24: IV. New Goals continued  Q59  New Goal 4:	Respondent skipped this question
Q60 Which College Strategic Goal does this department goal most directly support?	Respondent skipped this question
Q61 Please describe how this goal advances the college strategic goal identified above.	Respondent skipped this question
Q62  Please indicate how this goal was informed by SLO (student learning outcome) assessment results, PLO (program learning outcome) assessment results, student achievement data, or other qualitative or quantitative data (from any source):	Respondent skipped this question
Q63  Action steps for this year:If you are requesting resources in order to achieve this goal, please list them below as action steps and specify the type of request (e.g. submit technology request for new computer hardware).	Respondent skipped this question
Q64 How will this goal be evaluated?	Respondent skipped this question
Page 25: V. Resources Needed to Achieve Goal(s)  Q65  What resources is your program requesting this year to achieve the program's goal(s)?	My program is currently not requesting any resources at this time

Page 27: Final Check

# I am ready to submit my program review

Are you ready to submit your program review?If you would like to go back and review a section, select a section a click "Next."