

PROGRAM REVIEW STEERING COMMITTEE

Spring 2025 Comprehensive Feedback Rubric

InstructionalPILOT (24-25)

Department/Program:

Author(s):

PRSC Approved: 2/6/2025

Directions for PRSC Team: For each component of the program review, please rate the response as one of the following: Initial, Evolving, Established. All areas marked as initial or evolving need further clarification in the comments section.

PROCESS

Program Overview and Update			
	No	Yes	
Program Review team represents collaborative effort.	no evidence of input/participation in the development of program review	evidence of input/participation both within and beyond the department	
Comments:			

Program Reflection and Description					
Items	Initial	Emerging	Developed	Highly Developed	
Provide your program's mission statement. If your program does not have a mission statement, what is your timeline for creating a mission statement?	no discussion of program's mission statement and or plan to create a mission statement	program does not currently have a mission statement but plans/timelines for creating a mission statement were discussed	program has a mission statement, described the mission statement	program has a mission statement, described the mission statement and connected the mission statement and/or department goals	
Is the program description in the current college catalog up to date and accurate? If you answered no above, what steps will you take to revise the college catalog description?	description not current/up to date/accurate; no discussion of plan/timeline to update	description not current/up to date/accurate, but plan/timeline to update was discussed	description is current/up to date/accurate	description is current/up to date/accurate and plan to ensure catalog information is current is discussed	
Describe how your program advances the College's vision of equity, excellence, and social justice through education. How does the program reflect the College's mission and values?	no discussion of how the program advances the college vision, reflects the mission and values	general discussion of how the program advances the college vision, reflects the mission and values, but no specific examples	general discussion of how the program advances the college vision, reflects the college mission, including specific examples	detailed discussion of how the program advances the college vision, reflects the college mission, including specific examples	
Comments:					

Exemplary Status
N/A

Courses Curriculum, Assessment and Student Success					
Items	Initial	Emerging	Developed	Highly Developed	
Provide an overview of your program's Curriculum Review and Development status. Have all of your active course outlines been reviewed within the last five years? If you answered "No" above, please explain.	less than half of the program's active course outlines have been reviewed in the past 5 years	over half, but not all, of the program's active course outlines have been reviewed in the past 5 years	all of the program's active course outlines have been reviewed in the past 5 years	all of the program's active course outlines have been reviewed in the past 5 years and a summary of recent course changes/improvements is noted	
Please list any planned changes from the current semester forward for curriculum (courses, degrees, and/or certificates) and the rationale for those changes.	no changes discussed and no discussion of why no changes were needed	planned changes to curriculum discussed but no rationale provided	planned changes to curriculum discussed and rationale provided or no changes needed and rationale provided	planned changes to curriculum discussed with timelines and rationale provided	
For Transfer Programs: How is your program meeting the transfer needs of students, and/or articulation with four-year institutions?	no discussion of how program is meeting the needs of transfer students and/or articulation with 4-year institutions	general discussion of how program is meeting the needs of transfer students and/or articulation with 4-year institutions	general discussion of how program is meeting the needs of transfer students and/or articulation with 4-year institutions including specific examples	detailed discussion of how program is meeting the needs of transfer students and/or articulation with 4-year institutions including specific examples and discussion of relevant, available data	not a transfer program
For Career Education Programs: For Career Education Programs: How is your program meeting labor market demand and preparing students to enter the workforce?	no discussion of how program is meeting the needs of labor market/workforce	general discussion of how program is meeting the needs of labor market/workforce	discussion of how program is meeting the needs of labor market/workforce with specific examples	detailed discussion of how program is meeting the needs of labor market/workforce with specific examples and advisory committee information/meeting notes	not a career education program
Please upload an updated, current version of your SLO assessment plan. (Ideally, the updated plan should specify assessment semesters for all courses over the next 4 years, between this comprehensive program review and the next.)	no assessment plan uploaded	assessment plan uploaded and plan specifies assessment semester for all courses over the next 4 years (schedule information only, p.1)	assessment plan uploaded and plan specifies assessment semester for all courses over the next 4 years (schedule information plus some additional components of assessment plan but not all)	assessment plan uploaded and plan specifies assessment semester for all courses over the next 4 years; addresses all areas in plan template (schedule, mapping, method of assessment, and communication plan)	
What do your SLO data suggest about student experiences, successes, and challenges in your service area?	no discussion	general discussion of student experiences, successes, or challenges but no specific examples	discussion of student experiences, successes, or challenges including specific examples	detailed discussion of student experiences, successes, or challenges including specific examples	

Exemplary Status
N/A
not a transfer program
not a career education program

Share an example of meaningful, innovative, equitable, and/or student-centered SLO assessment happening in your program.	no examples shared	example shared but minimal details provided		example shared with details provided		example shared with details provided and discussion of next steps	
Discuss how your SLO data are being used for course and/or program improvements for student retention, success, and/or goal achievement.	no discussion	general discussion of how SLO data are being used but no details or specific examples		discussion of how SLO data are being used with specific examples		detailed discussion of how SLO data are being used with specific examples	
Comments:							

Degree and Certificate Programs							Exemplary Status
Items	Initial	Emerging		Developed		Highly Developed	N/A
For each degree and certificate indicate how many awards were conferred in the past five years. Please comment on any trends and provide context to explain any increases or decreases.	no spreadsheet uploaded, no comments made	spreadsheet uploaded but no comment on the data trends, context, or implications		spreadsheet uploaded; discussion of the data trends		spreadsheet uploaded; discussion of the data trends, context, and implications	no degrees or certificates offered
Indicate when each degree and certificate was last reviewed and updated (semester), if this information is available (e.g., via internal program records or Curriculum Committee minutes).	no information on last degree/certificate review provided	information provided on some but not all degrees/certificates in the discipline/program		information provided on all degrees/certificates in the discipline/program		information provided on all degrees/certificates in the discipline/program and plans for any upcoming changes are noted	no degrees or certificates offered
Can students complete the degree/certificate requirements within a two-year period? If you answered "No" above, please explain.	response of "No" with no plan to come into compliance	response of "No" with plan to come into compliance		response of "Yes"		response of "Yes" and discussion of how the program ensures students can complete degrees within 2 years	no degrees or certificates offered
	Multiple Choice						N/A
For programs with degrees and/or certificates: How is your program currently assessing its PLOs? Please select all that apply.	SLO-to-PLO mapping	direct assessment w/capstone course project, test or assignment		shared PLO assessment across the ACPs		Other	no degrees or certificates offered
ITEM	Initial	Emerging		Developed		Highly Developed	N/A
PLOs need to be assessed every 4 years. Please provide the following for each degree/certificate: -the most recent semester each of your program(s) assessed PLOs; -brief summer of findings; and -overview of changes made as a result	no information on PLO assessment provided	PLO assessment for some programs discussed, including most recent semester for assessment, but other information missing		PLOs for each program assessed, brief summary of findings provided		PLOs assessed, brief summary of findings, and overview of changes made	no degrees or certificates offered
	Initial	Emerging		Developed		Highly Developed	N/A
For programs with degrees and/or certificates: Are all of your degree maps completed? <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No, what are your plans to complete the degree maps for your program?	no, degree maps not posted, no explanation	no, degree maps not completed but general plan to complete degree maps noted		no, degree maps are not completed for some programs and plans are described for remaining program maps to be completed, including timelines		yes, degree maps completed for all programs	no degrees or certificates offered
For programs with degrees and/or certificates: Are the degree maps posted to the college website? <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No, what are your plans to publish the degree maps for your program?	<input type="checkbox"/> no, degree maps not posted, no plans to publish noted	<input type="checkbox"/> no, degree maps not posted but general plan to post degree maps noted		<input type="checkbox"/> no, some but not all degree maps not posted but plan to post degree maps, including timelines, noted		<input type="checkbox"/> yes, degree maps posted for all programs	no degrees or certificates offered
ITEM	Initial	Emerging		Developed		Highly Developed	N/A
For programs with degrees and/or certificates: How are you currently assessing your PLOs? If you are not currently assessing PLOs, what is your plan to assess PLOs in the future?	no description of how the program is currently assessing PLOs and no plan to assess PLOs	outline or bulleted summary of how the program plans to assess PLOs in the future		description of how the program is currently assessing PLOs		description of how the program is assessing PLOs and plans to sustain PLO assessment	no degrees or certificates offered
For programs with degrees and/or certificates: How are your PLO assessments informing improvements/changes to your program?	PLOs not assessed	PLOs assessed and results summarized but no changes or improvements mentioned		PLOs assessed and results summarized; changes or improvements based on the results are noted		PLOs assessed and results summarized; changes or improvements based on the results are noted and plans for continuous improvement included	no degrees or certificates offered
Comments:							

Student Achievement							Exemplary Status
ITEM	Initial	Emerging		Developed		Highly Developed	N/A
Please describe any enrollment changes (increases/decreases) over the past 4 years and the context for these changes. For example, context for enrollment changes may include shifts in modality, class scheduling time change, using block scheduling, program specific outreach to feeder schools and community partners about the program, ACP or program in-reach events, community presentations, labor market demand, industry changes etc.	no description of enrollment changes	general summary of enrollment changes; no specific examples or context provided		detailed description of enrollment changes and context for these changes		detailed description of enrollment changes and context for these changes and connection to department goals/plans	

If your program has seen a significant decline in enrollment over the past 4 years, what resources or support would be helpful to improve program enrollment and access?	no response	description of challenges but no mention of questions, resources/support needed	description of challenges, questions, resources/support needed	description of challenges, questions, resources/support needed and initial plans to address enrollment decline	no significant decline in enrollment
What is the program doing to increase student enrollment or access?	no explanation of what the program is doing to increase student enrollment/access	general overview of what the program is doing to increase student enrollment/access	detailed description of what the program is doing to increase student enrollment/access, including specific examples	detailed description of what the program is doing to increase student enrollment/access, including specific examples, connected to department goals/plans	
What is your program's overall course success rate? How has it changed over the past 4-5 years? Please note any trends and context for the data.	no discussion of program success rate/trends	general overview of program success rate/trends	detailed description of program success rate and trends with specific data	detailed description of program success rate/trends and context for these trends	
Please review the college-wide and program data sets, which have identified equity gaps based on the following criteria: 3% n=10 students/enrollments. Which groups are experiencing equity gaps in your program for success rate and/or retention rate? Please discuss all equity gaps identified in the data.	no discussion of equity gaps	general overview of equity gaps but no specific data points or examples	detailed description of equity gaps with specific data points/examples	detailed description of equity gaps with specific data points/examples and comparison to previous years	
What department/discipline (or institutional) factors may be contributing to these lower rates of success for these groups of students?	no discussion of department/institutional factors	brief/general overview of department/institutional factors; no specific examples	detailed reflection on department/institutional factors with specific examples	detailed reflection on department/institutional factors with specific examples and initial plans to address	
How has this data shaped your comprehensive program review goals and action steps? Please include specific actions the program will take to address equity gaps.	no discussion of how data has shaped goals/action steps	general overview of how data has shaped goals/action steps	detailed description of how data has shaped goals/action steps, including specific examples/links to goals	detailed description of how data has shaped goals/action steps, including specific examples/links to goals; information on how the program will use the data to inform their	
Discuss your department/discipline's plan for diversifying department faculty in alignment with the GCCCD Board Resolution 20-015	no discussion of plans to diversify department faculty	brief overview of plans to diversify faculty, no specific examples or details provided	detailed description of plans to diversify faculty, including specific examples/details provided	detailed discussion on plans to address diversity hiring practices and connected to department plans/goals	
What other qualitative or quantitative data, if any, is the department/discipline using to inform its planning for this comprehensive program review? Please reference additional internal or external data, such as retention and enrollment, student survey results, focus groups, student throughput, or other data, if there are any notable trends.	no discussion of other (in addition to standard program review data) data the department is using	brief, general overview of other data the department is using to inform its planning; no specific data points or examples provided	detailed description of other data the department is using to inform its planning; specific data points and examples provided	detailed description of other data the department is using to inform its planning; specific data points and examples provided and connection to goals/plans noted	
Comments:					

Distance Education Course Success					Exemplary Status
ITEM	Initial	Emerging	Developed	Highly Developed	N/A
If your department offers distance education classes, how do you ensure Regular and Substantive Interaction (RSI) is being implemented?	no discussion of how the department ensures RSI	brief, general overview of how the department ensures RSI; no examples provided	detailed discussion of plans for ensuring RSI; examples provided	detailed discussion of plan for ensuring RSI, including details and progress made on implementation of the plan; implementation is clearly demonstrated as department-wide	no distance education classes offered
If there are differences in success rates for distance education (online) versus in-person classes, what will the program do to address these disparities? If there are no differences, what did the program do to achieve that?	no discussion of distance education data/success rates	brief, general overview of distance education data/success rates	detailed discussion of distance education data/success rates, including specific data points; general plans to address gaps in success rate (if applicable) are included	detailed discussion of distance education data/success rates, including specific data points; general plans to address gaps in success rate (if applicable) are included, and if no gaps in success rate, explanation/context provided	no distance education classes offered
Comments:					

Career Exploration and Program Demand					Exemplary Status
	No	Yes			N/A
Is your program a career education program (e.g., does it prepare students to directly enter the workforce)?	no	yes			
ITEM For Career Education Programs	Initial	Emerging	Developed	Highly Developed	
Please share your observations about the employment rate for your program over the last 4 years.	no observations noted	general observations summarized, but no specific details or data points referenced	detailed observations summarized with specific details/data points referenced	detailed observations summarized with specific details/data points referenced, including context and connection to goals/plans	not a career education program
What is the institution-set standard for your program's employment rate? The institution set standard is what you would consider the lowest acceptable employment rate for your program (or "floor").	no institution-set standard noted	institution-set standard noted, but no context provided	Institution-set standard noted, context provided	institution-set standard noted, context provided; connection to goals/plans	not a career education program
What would you like your program's employment rate to be, ideally (stretch goal)?	no stretch goal noted	stretch goal noted, but no context provided	stretch goal noted, context provided	stretch goal noted, context provided; connection to goals/plans	not a career education program
What do the latest labor market data reveal about the careers (including those for transfer students) for which your program prepares students? Consider what career information you would share with students on a career or transfer pathway in your area.	no discussion of labor market implications for the program	brief, general discussion of labor market implications for the program; no specific examples or data points referenced	detailed discussion of labor market implications for the program, including specific examples/data points	detailed discussion of labor market implications for the program, including specific examples/data points and connection to goals/plans	not a career education program
Comments:					

Strengths, Challenges & External Influences						Exemplary Status
SECTIONS	Initial		Emerging	Developed	Highly Developed	
Please describe your program's strengths.		no discussion of program strengths	brief, general discussion on program area strengths		detailed discussion on program area strengths, including specific examples	detailed discussion on program area strengths, including specific examples and connection to goals/plans
Please describe your program's challenges.		no discussion of program challenges	brief, general discussion on program area challenges		detailed discussion on program area challenges, including specific examples	detailed discussion on program area challenges, including specific examples and connection to goals/plans
Please describe external influences that affect your program (both positively and negatively).		no discussion of external influences	brief, general discussion on external influences		detailed discussion on external influences, including specific examples	detailed discussion on external influences including specific examples and connection to goals/plans
Given these factors, what opportunities exist for the service area to advance the College's goals in the next 4 years?		no discussion of opportunities	brief, general discussion on opportunities		detailed discussion on opportunities, including specific examples	detailed discussion on opportunities, including specific examples and connection to goals/plans
Comments:						

Program Goals						Exemplary Status
SECTIONS	Initial	Emerging	Developed	Highly Developed		
Goal Status: For Each Goal						
Goal 1:						
IF Completed: Please describe the results or explain the reason for completion of the goal:	no results discussed	results discussed, but no supporting data or evaluation information	results discussed with supporting data/evaluation information	results discussed with supporting data/evaluation information; future implications/plans noted		
IF Not Started: please share why - including whether your program is experiencing barriers for starting this goal	no discussion of rationale for not starting on the goal	discussion of rationale for not starting on the goal	discussion of rationale for not starting on the goal, plan to start working on the goal noted	discussion of rationale for not starting on the goal, plan to start working on the goal clearly explained with timelines		
IF In Progress: what actions steps from the last report have been completed and which ones are you still working towards	no explanation or description of progress made	explanation/description of progress made	explanation/description of progress made with specific action steps for the year on this goal	explanation/description of progress made with specific action steps for the year on this goal with details for expected outcomes and measures		
IF New Goals Added in Fall 2024 Program Review Action Steps Identified	no action steps/plans discussed	action steps/plans for 2024-25 discussed	action steps/plans for 2024-25 discussed; resource needs identified, evaluation plan noted	action steps/plans for 2024-25 discussed; resource needs identified, evaluation plan noted; goal rationale includes assessment and/or student achievement data		
If applicable, Goal 2:						
IF Completed: Please describe the results or explain the reason for completion of the goal:	no results discussed	results discussed, but no supporting data or evaluation information	results discussed with supporting data/evaluation information	results discussed with supporting data/evaluation information; future implications/plans noted		
IF Not Started: please share why - including whether your program is experiencing barriers for starting this goal	no discussion of rationale for not starting on the goal	discussion of rationale for not starting on the goal	discussion of rationale for not starting on the goal, plan to start working on the goal noted	discussion of rationale for not starting on the goal, plan to start working on the goal clearly explained with timelines		
IF In Progress: what actions steps from the last report have been completed and which ones are you still working towards	no explanation or description of progress made	explanation/description of progress made	explanation/description of progress made with specific action steps for the year on this goal	explanation/description of progress made with specific action steps for the year on this goal with details for expected outcomes and measures		
IF New Goals Added in Fall 2024 Program Review Action Steps Identified	no action steps/plans discussed	action steps/plans for 2024-25 discussed	action steps/plans for 2024-25 discussed; resource needs identified, evaluation plan noted	action steps/plans for 2024-25 discussed; resource needs identified, evaluation plan noted; goal rationale includes assessment		
If applicable, Goal 3:						
IF Completed: Please describe the results or explain the reason for completion of the goal:	no results discussed	results discussed, but no supporting data or evaluation information	results discussed with supporting data/evaluation information	results discussed with supporting data/evaluation information; future implications/plans noted		
IF Not Started: please share why - including whether your program is experiencing barriers for starting this goal	no discussion of rationale for not starting on the goal	discussion of rationale for not starting on the goal	discussion of rationale for not starting on the goal, plan to start working on the goal noted	discussion of rationale for not starting on the goal, plan to start working on the goal clearly explained with timelines		
IF In Progress: what actions steps from the last report have been completed and which ones are you still working towards	no explanation or description of progress made	explanation/description of progress made	explanation/description of progress made with specific action steps for the year on this goal	explanation/description of progress made with specific action steps for the year on this goal with details for expected outcomes and measures		

IF New Goals Added in Fall 2024 Program Review Action Steps Identified		no action steps/plans discussed		action steps/plans for 2024-25 discussed		action steps/plans for 2024-25 discussed; resource needs identified, evaluation plan noted		action steps/plans for 2024-25 discussed; resource needs identified, evaluation plan noted; goal rationale includes assessment and/or student achievement data	
If applicable, Goal 4:									
IF Completed : Please describe the results or explain the reason for completion of the goal:		no results discussed		results discussed, but no supporting data or evaluation information		results discussed with supporting data/evaluation information		results discussed with supporting data/evaluation information; future	
IF Not Started : please share why - including whether your program is experiencing barriers for starting this goal		no discussion of rationale for not starting on the goal		discussion of rationale for not starting on the goal		discussion of rationale for not starting on the goal, plan to start working on the goal noted		discussion of rationale for not starting on the goal, plan to start working on the goal clearly	
IF In Progress : what actions steps from the last report have been completed and which ones are you still working towards		no explanation or description of progress made		explanation/description of progress made		explanation/description of progress made with specific action steps for the year on this		explanation/description of progress made with specific action steps for the year on this goal	
IF New Goals Added in Fall 2024 Program Review Action Steps Identified		no action steps/plans discussed		action steps/plans for 2024-25 discussed		action steps/plans for 2024-25 discussed; resource needs identified, evaluation plan		action steps/plans for 2024-25 discussed; resource needs identified, evaluation plan	
If applicable, Goal 5:									
IF Completed : Please describe the results or explain the reason for completion of the goal:		no results discussed		results discussed, but no supporting data or evaluation information		results discussed with supporting data/evaluation information		results discussed with supporting data/evaluation information; future implications/plans noted	
IF Not Started : please share why - including whether your program is experiencing barriers for starting this goal		no discussion of rationale for not starting on the goal		discussion of rationale for not starting on the goal		discussion of rationale for not starting on the goal, plan to start working on the goal noted		discussion of rationale for not starting on the goal, plan to start working on the goal clearly explained with timelines	
IF In Progress : what actions steps from the last report have been completed and which ones are you still working towards		no explanation or description of progress made		explanation/description of progress made		explanation/description of progress made with specific action steps for the year on this goal		explanation/description of progress made with specific action steps for the year on this goal with details for expected outcomes and measures	
IF New Goals Added in Fall 2024 Program Review Action Steps Identified		no action steps/plans discussed		action steps/plans for 2024-25 discussed		action steps/plans for 2024-25 discussed; resource needs identified, evaluation plan noted		action steps/plans for 2024-25 discussed; resource needs identified, evaluation plan noted; goal rationale includes assessment and/or student achievement data	

	No	Yes
IF Deleted : Please describe the results or explain the reason for deletion of the goal:	no rationale discussed for deletion of goals	clear rationale provided for goal deletion
Goal Mapping:		
	No	Yes
College Strategic Goal Indicated	no program goals mapped to a college strategic goal	at least one program goal is mapped to a college strategic goal
	No	Yes
Resources Requested to Achieve Goal:	no resource needs noted	at least one resource need noted

Comments:

RESOURCE REQUESTS LINKED TO PROGRAM REVIEW GOALS Resource requests are linked to specific department/ discipline goals and action steps and include details on the expected impact on the program.	no connection to department/discipline goal or action step(s)	limited connection to department/ discipline goal or action step(s)	clear connection to department/discipline goal or action step(s)	
--	--	--	---	--

Note: All resource requests must be connected to a current program review submission

Comments: