

# Essay Evaluation and Response

Timothy L. Pagaard

|                |        |         |
|----------------|--------|---------|
| STUDENT'S NAME | COURSE | SECTION |
|----------------|--------|---------|

ESSAY ASSIGNMENT NUMBER  1  2  3  4  5

In order to focus your efforts as you revise this and future essays, you need a comprehensive idea of what considerations have informed my evaluation.

Below I have rated your success in managing some important aspects of writing. Your performance in each is marked along a continuum, with maximum effectiveness shown on the

left, minimum effectiveness on the right.

Please be aware that I have not arrived at your grade by averaging points. The considerations below are not quantifiable in isolation. Their relative weight changes from essay to essay depending upon the impact each has upon the whole.

**NO MARK = NOT APPLICABLE**

## 1 CONTENT (what you have to say)

*Assignment*— You satisfy the specific demands of this project.

+ \_\_\_\_\_ -  
Also,  \_\_\_\_\_ words too long  \_\_\_\_\_ words too short

*Insight*— You understand your subject and say interesting things about it.

+ \_\_\_\_\_ -

*Clarity*— Your insights are accessible to your readers.

+ \_\_\_\_\_ -

*Originality of approach*— You take a fresh look at your subject.

+ \_\_\_\_\_ -

*Logical development*— Your argument/exposition makes sense and is convincing.

+ \_\_\_\_\_ -

*Evidence*— You support assertions/generalizations with specific, concrete detail.

+ \_\_\_\_\_ -

*Research*— You have enlarged your knowledge of your subject.

+ \_\_\_\_\_ -

You use secondary material (quoting/paraphrasing/summarizing) effectively.

+ \_\_\_\_\_ -

Please review my "Four-Step Process"

You seem to rely too heavily upon either the words or the ideas of your source(s). Please see me *at once*.

*Heat*— You clearly feel strongly about your subject.

+ \_\_\_\_\_ -

## 2 STRUCTURE (the arrangement of parts)

*Organization*— You divide your subject into logical, cohesive parts and arrange them effectively.

+ \_\_\_\_\_ -

*Title*— is accurate, specific, and compelling.

+ \_\_\_\_\_ -

*Introduction*— is relevant and entertaining, effectively "selling" the essay.

+ \_\_\_\_\_ -

*Thesis statement*— You state your controlling idea clearly, early, and often.

+ \_\_\_\_\_ -

Articulate more precisely your  limited subject  unique angle.

*Paragraphs*— are developed logically, economically, and artfully.

+ \_\_\_\_\_ -

Revise to include effective  topic  concluding sentences.

*Transitions*— Connections between paragraphs, sections, and ideas are clear.

+ \_\_\_\_\_ -

*Sentences*— are economical, varied in length, type, and pattern.

+ \_\_\_\_\_ -

*Conclusion*— provides a sense of closure.

+ \_\_\_\_\_ -

## EVALUATION

Your **RAW SCORE** on this assignment \_\_\_\_\_

- Preparation for *writing conference* ( $\pm 2$ ) \_\_\_\_\_
- *Workshop draft* (none: -10 / partial: -5) \_\_\_\_\_
- Quality and extent of *workshop input* ( $\pm 2$ ) \_\_\_\_\_
- *Late submission* (-10 per week) \_\_\_\_\_
- *Editing* (-20 maximum penalty) \_\_\_\_\_ \*
- *Research assignment* (+20 possible) \_\_\_\_\_

Your adjusted score, **YOUR GRADE** \_\_\_\_\_

*Grading scale (scale for research paper shown at bottom)*

|           |          |          |          |   |
|-----------|----------|----------|----------|---|
| 40 points | 30       | 20       | 10       | 1 |
| <b>A</b>  | <b>B</b> | <b>C</b> | <b>D</b> |   |
| 60 points | 45       | 30       | 15       | 1 |

\* These points come back with revision. But remember: You may revise only #1 and #2. So take responsibility for gaining control of editing long before submitting #3.

## 3 EDITING (housekeeping) \_\_\_\_\_ sentence-boundary errors (-5 points each)

*Mechanics*— Grammar and punctuation do not distract, do not present a barrier to understanding your essay or to accepting your authority.

+ \_\_\_\_\_ -  
 Your revision will not be accepted without a signed Writing Center referral form.

*Spelling*— is similarly not a barrier.

+ \_\_\_\_\_ -

Please review  hyphenation  possession/apostrophes  
 capitalization  numbers and numerals

*Format*— You conform closely to MLA conventions (see handout, handbook).

+ \_\_\_\_\_ -

Please review conventions for  heading  header  title  
 type size (11 pt.)  type face (Roman)  citations  Works Cited

## GENERAL COMMENTS

---



---



---



---



---



---



---



---



---



---

**WRITERS WORKSHOP GROUP** Please list names of group members.

---



---

## REVISION

You may resubmit this essay any time before \_\_\_\_\_.

**REVISION MEANS LARGE-SCALE REWRITING, not mere mechanical repair.**

*Thus, revision of considerations listed under 1 above will generally earn more additional points than those under 2 and significantly more than those under 3.*

## COMMENTS ON REVISION

---



---



---

★ ADJUSTED GRADE: \_\_\_\_\_

**BE SURE TO ATTACH YOUR ORIGINAL MARKED ESSAY AND THIS FORM TO YOUR REVISION. NO REVISION WILL BE ACCEPTED WITHOUT THESE. IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS—ESPECIALLY IF YOU NEED FURTHER ADVICE ON HOW BEST TO PROCEED WITH YOUR REVISION—PLEASE SEE ME.**

## Correction Symbols

I have responded to your writing in the margins and between the lines of your draft, making comments and suggestions for revision. I have also marked mechanical errors, using the notation explained below. If you have any questions as to my meaning, please see me or consult your usage handbook.

I have underlined words and phrases in your draft that need attention. Anything written above these *in parentheses* is a recommended *change or correction to your wording*. Everything else is commentary. For example,

...this comment features a suggested change:      ...and this one doesn't:  
    ww (ambidextrous?)      agr s/v  
 The batter was amphibious.      We was amazed.

### EDITING NOTATION

| MARK            | ERROR                          | MARK    | ERROR   | MARK       | ERROR  |
|-----------------|--------------------------------|---------|---|------------|--|
| ab              | = faulty abbreviation          | doc     | = documentation needed                              | shift: per | = distracting shift in person or point of view |
| adv             | = use adverb                   | frag    | = sentence fragment                                 | sp         | = spelling error                               |
| agr p/a         | = pronoun/antecedent agreement | mm      | = misplaced modifier                                | trans      | = transition needed                            |
| agr s/v         | = subject/verb agreement       | num     | = error in use of number (spell out or use numeral) | vt         | = verb tense                                   |
| <u>awk word</u> | = awkward diction              | para // | = faulty parallel                                   | vt shift   | = distracting shift in verb tense              |
| case            | = error in case                | ref     | = unclear pronoun reference                         | ww         | = wrong word                                   |
| cs              | = comma splice                 | fused   | = fused ("run-on") sentence                         |            |  |
|                 |                                | sexist  | = language that could be perceived as sexist        |            |  |

### PROOFREADERS' MARKS

| MARK                    | MEANING  | MARK                | MEANING                                    | MARK         | MEANING                  |
|-------------------------|--|---------------------|--|--------------|--------------------------|
| <del>word</del><br>word | = delete; take out                                     | words some          | = transpose words, letters, or punctuation | some words   | = insert hyphen          |
| another<br>add word     | = insert   | some word           |  | some words   | = insert dash            |
| stet<br>word            | = let stand (ignore correction mark)                   | word                |  | some words   | = insert semicolon       |
| ] some words            | = indent (move right)                                  | some words          | = break for new line                       | some words   | = insert colon           |
| [ some words            | = don't indent (move left)                             | ¶                   | = break for new paragraph                  | don't        | = insert apostrophe      |
| ] Title [               | = center-align   | no ¶                | = no paragraph break                       | A quotation. | = insert quotation marks |
| #<br>somewords          | = insert space   | <del>Not Name</del> | = make lower case                          | A question?  | = insert question mark   |
| some words              | = close up (or join clauses to form a single sentence) | name                | = make upper case                          |              |                          |
|                         |  | some Words          | = insert period                            |              |                          |
|                         |  | some words          | = insert comma                             |              |                          |